

Challenged Documents Highlighted

No.	Cardinal's PrivLog No.	Date	Family			Ruling
1	CAH_MDL_PRIV 000557*	11/12/07	Fully withheld family including one (1) attachment: Privilege Challenged over the full family			Privilege applies and the documents may be withheld, but the final version of the expert report at issue must be produced.
2	CAH-MDL-PRIV 001316*	12/18/07	Fully withheld family including eight (8) attachments: Privilege Challenged over the full family			For the reasons stated in Discovery Ruling No. 14-5, these Dendrite-related documents must be produced.
3	CAH_MDL2804_02199748	12/21/07	Bates Range	Priv Log ID Number	Status	Ruling
			CAH_MDL2804_02199748	CAH_MDL_PRIV_001457	Produced redacted: Not Challenged	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02199749	CAH_MDL_PRIV_001456*	Slipsheeted as Priv: Challenged	Privilege applies and the document may be withheld.
			CAH_MDL2804_02199750	CAH_MDL_PRIV_001455*	Slipsheeted as Priv: Challenged	Privilege applies and the document may be withheld.
			CAH_MDL2804_02199751 (Produced 02199751 to - 751 006)	CAH_MDL_PRIV_001454	Produced on 1/11/19	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02199757	--	Produced on 10/25/18	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02199757	--	Produced on 10/25/18	n/a
4	CAH_MDL_PRIV 003199*	5/29/08	Fully withheld family including one (1) attachment: Privilege Challenged over the full family			Privilege applies and the document may be withheld.
5	CAH_MDL2804_02581970	2/13/09	Bates Range	Priv Log ID Number	Status	Ruling
			CAH_MDL2804_02581970 – 972	CAH_MDL_PRIV_003947	Produced redacted: Not Challenged	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02581973	CAH_MDL_PRIV_003946*	Slipsheeted as Priv: Challenged	Privilege applies and the document may be withheld.
6	CAH_MDL_PRIV 004932	10/16/09	As part of the ordered downgrade review process, Cardinal identified this document to be downgraded and, as a result, this document will be produced.			n/a
7	CAH_MDL_PRIV 004933	10/16/09	As part of the ordered downgrade review process, Cardinal identified this document to be downgraded and, as a result, this document will be produced.			n/a
8	CAH_MDL2804_02316570	11/3/10	Bates Range	Priv Log ID Number	Status	Ruling
			CAH_MDL2804_02316570	--	Produced on 10/25/18	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02316571	CAH_MDL_PRIV_005899*	Slipsheeted as Priv: Challenged	Privilege applies and the document may be withheld.

9	CAH_MDL2804_02504457	11/28/11	Bates Range	Priv Log ID Number	Status	Ruling
			CAH_MDL2804_02504457	--	Produced on 10/25/18	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02504458	CAH_MDL_PRIV_008594*	Slipsheeted as Priv: Challenged	For the reasons stated in Discovery Ruling No. 14-5, these Dendrite-related documents must be produced.
			CAH_MDL2804_02504459	CAH_MDL_PRIV_008593	Slipsheeted as Priv: Not Challenged	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02504460	CAH_MDL_PRIV_008592	Slipsheeted as Priv: Not Challenged	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02504461	CAH_MDL_PRIV_008591	Slipsheeted as Priv: Not Challenged	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02504462	CAH_MDL_PRIV_008590	Slipsheeted as Priv: Not Challenged	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02504463	CAH_MDL_PRIV_008589	Slipsheeted as Priv: Not Challenged	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02504464	CAH_MDL_PRIV_008588	Slipsheeted as Priv: Not Challenged	n/a
10	CAH_MDL_PRIV_009923*	1/11/12	Fully withheld email with no attachments: Privilege Challenged			Privilege applies and the documents may be withheld.
11	CAH_MDL2804_02117556	2/3/12	Bates Range	Priv Log ID Number	Status	Ruling
			CAH_MDL2804_02117556	--	Produced on 10/25/18	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02117557	CAH_MDL_PRIV_010401*	Slipsheeted as Priv: Challenged	Privilege applies and the documents may be withheld.
			CAH_MDL2804_02117558	CAH_MDL_PRIV_010400*	Slipsheeted as Priv: Challenged	Privilege applies and the documents may be withheld.
						Note: the spreadsheet attachment need not be produced, but the type of information contained in the spreadsheet generally must be produced if responsive to a discovery request.
12	CAH_MDL2804_02899253*	2/5/12	Redacted email with no attachments: Privilege Challenged			The redactions are appropriate.
13	CAH_MDL_PRIV_016924*	6/11/12	Fully withheld email with one (1) attachment: Privilege Challenged over the full family			For the reasons stated in Discovery Ruling No. 14-5, this Dendrite-related document must be produced.
14	CAH_MDL2804_02125972	7/18/12	Bates Range	Priv Log ID Number	Status	Ruling
			CAH_MDL2804_02125976	--	Produced on 10/25/18	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02125977 – 997	CAH_MDL_PRIV_018372	Produced Redacted: Not Challenged	n/a
			CAH_MDL2804_02125998 – 6018	CAH_MDL_PRIV_018371*	Produced Redacted: Challenged	The redactions are appropriate.
			CAH_MDL2804_02126019 – 025	--	Produced on 10/25/18	n/a

* Denotes documents that were challenged by Plaintiffs.